

The influence of collection and enrollment performance on remains to be paid: A study in the regional medical councils in the years 2015 to 2022

Dalila da Silva Barbosa Coelho¹.

ABSTRACT

The implementation of public policies and what has been established as obligations of the State to provide for the social needs contained in the Magna Carta necessarily permeate the government planning instruments, namely, the Multi-Year Plan Law (PPA), the Budget Guidelines Law (LDO) and the Annual Budget Law (LOA).

Keywords: Government planning, Public management, Financial control.

INTRODUCTION

The implementation of public policies and what has been established as the State's obligations to provide for the social needs contained in the Magna Carta necessarily permeate government planning instruments, namely, the Multi-Year Plan Law (PPA), the Budget Guidelines Law (LDO) and the Annual Budget Law (LOA) (BRASIL, 1988).

Souza and Rodrigues (2018) in alignment with Decker, Rosa and Costa (2018) highlight the prominent role of the budget since it is the materialization of what was planned in the PPA and LDO, and revenues must be foreseen and expenses fixed, considering the sensitive nature of the first and significant of the second, and must always seek budget balance.

As a result of this balance, the figure of Remains Payable gains relevance, becoming not only an object of study, but of inspection by the control bodies, since it, although it is provided for by law, can cause a misalignment in the planning and a compromise of programs, projects and activities in the following financial year. (Andrade, 2022).

The institute of Remains to Pay was established through Federal Law 4.320 of March 17, 1964, a provision that established the General Rules of Financial Law for the preparation and control of the budgets and balance sheets of the Union, the States, the Municipalities and the Federal District, being considered Remains to Pay the expenses committed, but not paid until December 31, distinguishing the processed from the unprocessed.

The studies by Feitosa and Freitas (2021) and Andrade (2022) reaffirm how this topic is the focus of discussion and research, since it is through this legal institute that the change in the behavior of public

¹ Federal University of Bahia – Bahia



managers during budget execution has been observed, since external factors influence their decision-making, may or may not overload the following financial year.

The evidence from the research by Araújo (2022) and Silva (2023) demonstrates that public managers, invested in their role as decision-makers (competent authority), can increase budget revenue, in a discretionary manner, providing them with greater freedom about the realization of expenses through the remains to be paid.

Considering the particular circumstances experienced in the last 8 years in Brazil, from the perspective of the theory of public choice, which is appropriate for the moment, this work seeks to support how the manipulation of budget revenues, through the performance of collection, can influence the decision-making process (Sallaberry, Quaesner, Costa & Clemente, 2020).

Thus, considering the context presented, and aiming to contribute to this discussion, that the expenses incurred and registered in remains payable, whether processed or unprocessed, when exceeding the financial year that gave rise to it, can significantly impact the financial performance of the Institution, this work intends to answer as a research problem: What is the influence of the performance of the collection on the registration of expenses in remains payable in the Regional Councils of Medicine in the period from 2015 to 2022?

The present study aims to draw a general overview of the remains payable at the federal level and analyze their execution in the Regional Councils of Medicine in the period from 2015 to 2022, being restricted to the scope of the Professional Inspection Councils, due to the fact that such bodies have administrative and financial autonomy, that is, they are not part of the direct administration, managing their own resources.

This choice is justified due to the role they play in society, acting as a protective factor for it, in addition to their budget revenues earned, having been in the order of 654 million reais in 2021, according to the Federal Court of Accounts. Considering the high resource, the work offers a reflection on the analysis of the registration of remains payable and its relationship with the performance of the collection and the relevance of this practice in compromising the financial execution of the budget of the following year.

Finally, the work is organized into four topics, in addition to this introduction, the second topic brings the literature review, presenting the contextualization of remains to be paid and public budget, the choices of public managers and their interests and the medical councils; then the research methodology will be debated and the research design will be presented; In the fourth topic, the results will be presented and, finally, the final considerations of the work.

OBJECTIVE

The present study aims to draw a general overview of the remains payable at the federal level and analyze their execution in the Regional Councils of Medicine in the period from 2015 to 2022, being restricted to the scope of the Professional Inspection Councils, due to the fact that such bodies have administrative and financial autonomy, that is, they are not part of the direct administration, managing their own resources.

METHODOLOGY

ECONOMETRIC MODEL

To estimate the association between the budget manipulation of revenue and the level of registration of expenses in the remaining payables of the CRMs, as well as to test the research hypothesis, Equation 1, based on Silva (2023), was used:

$$I_RP_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 I_DA_{it} + \beta_2 CON_{it} + \epsilon_{it}$$

Where:

- I_RP_{it} is an Indicator of Registration in Remains to Pay;
- I_DA_{it} is the Collection Performance Indicator;
- CON_{it} is a set of control variables used in the model (ELE, P_ELE and POP);
- ϵ_{it} represents the error of regression.

MEASUREMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF VARIABLES

The dependent variable I_RP represents the indicator of remains payable, a proxy for the effect of the discretionary choices of managers, and will be operationalized by means of an indicator resulting from the ratio between the sum of processed and unprocessed remains payable with the committed expense, therefore, the higher the result of this ratio, the higher the level of registration of remains payable in the CRM. (Silva, 2023)

I_DA is the variable of interest of the study, represents the assumption of overestimation of revenues in the annual budget and will be operationalized through the quotient of expected revenues over revenue collected. A positive influence on the registration of expenses in remains to be paid is expected. (Farjado, 2016; Jochimsen & Lehmann, 2017; and Silva, 2023).

In addition to the main variable mentioned above, based on previous research, the variables ELE and P_ELE, which represent election year and pre-election, respectively, were used to control for other effects that may influence the level of payables in the CRMs, and will be operationalized by means of a

dummy variable that assumes a value of 1 if an election or pre-election year and a value of 0 in other cases. A positive influence ratio is expected in an election and pre-election year on the registration of expenses in remains to be paid. (Queiroz, 2018 and Baerlocher & Schneider (2021).

Finally, the logarithm of the Population in the CRMs was used as a control variable, operationalized by the sum of registered professionals and companies, considering that the larger the population, the greater the public resources to meet their needs. (Queiroz, 2018 and Araújo et al, 2022).

Chart 01 – Description of Variables

Variable Type	Description	Code	Measurement	Authors	Expected Signal
Dependent	Indicator of Registration in Remains to Pay	I_RP	Remains to be paid Registered		Not applicable
			Committed expenditure		
Regardless of interest	Collection Performance Indicator	I_DA	Forecasted revenue	Fajardo (2016); Jochimsen e Lehmann (2017) e Silva (2023)	+
			Revenue collected		
Control independent	Election year	HE	Dummy variable; 1 election year (ELE) and 0 year without election	Queiroz (2018) and Baerlocher and Schneider (2021)	+
	Pre-election year	P_ HIM	Dummy variable; 1 year pre-election (PRE), and value 0 year without election	Queiroz (2018) and Baerlocher and Schneider (2021)	+
	Population	I_POP	Sum of the number of registered professionals and companies	Queiroz (2018) and Araújo et al (2022)	+

Source: Prepared by the authors

POPULATION AND SAMPLE SELECTION

The population (census) object of the study is made up of all professional inspection councils (CFPs), including federal and regional ones, legally regulated, between the years 2015 and 2022. This census is composed of 576 federal autarchies, comprising 30 professional systems distributed throughout the national territory.

The sample selected within the council universe was the Medicine system, which according to a survey carried out by the Federal Court of Accounts (TCU), occupies the 2nd place nationally in budget revenues. In addition, this sample is restricted to the Regional Councils, as they are the legal holders of the tax collection system and not the Federal Council.

The selected sample was from the 27 Regional Medical Councils (CRMs) (Annex I) based on all observations, from 2015 to 2022, for which data were available. The analysis began in 2015 because it was the first year in which the TCU began to vehemently inspect the CFPs and consequently the Internal

Control of the Federal Council of Medicine (CFM) made it mandatory to provide annual information on management results, as well as its finalistic activities.

This study sampled the budgetary and financial data of the 27 Regional Medical Councils during the period from 2015 to 2022, totaling 216 observations.

DATA COLLECTION AND PROCESSING PROCEDURES

Data collection was carried out exclusively through the internet, through the transparency portals of all Regional Medical Councils, in which the Management Report (RG) and the financial statements (budget balance and financial statement, etc.) are made available, among other elements, which contain the budgetary and financial information necessary for the measurement of the indicators that were used in the research.

RESULTS

DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS

Table 1 presents the descriptive statistics of the variables: registration of remains to be paid (I_RP), collection performance (I_DA), election year (ELE), pre-election year (P_ELE) and population (I_POP), corresponding to the 27 regional medical councils analyzed, in the period from 2015 to 2022, totaling 216 observations. In the years 2017 (pre-election year), 2018 (election year) and 2022 (pre-election year) the reflections of the dummies variables in the proportion of the remaining payables were analyzed.

Table 1 - Descriptive statistics

Variable	Average	Median	D.P.	My	Max	Obs. (n)
I_RP	0,0242	0,0104	0,0376	0,000	0,214	216
I_DA	1,09	1,05	0,143	0,739	1,88	216
HE	0,125	0,000	0,331	0,000	1,00	216
P_HIM	0,250	0,000	0,434	0,000	1,00	216
I_POP	9,27	9,22	1,33	2,37	12,4	216

Source: Survey Data

Note. D.P. = standard deviation, Min. = minimum, Max. = maximum and Obs. (n) = number of observations.

Analyzing the dependent variable, remains to be paid (I_RP), the average indicates that the enrollment in remains payable in the Regional Councils of Medicine was 2.42% in relation to the expenditure committed in each period. In addition, the standard deviation is 3.76%, which indicates that, on average, this distance from the mean was presented in the observations (Gujarati, 2011). The variation between the minimum (0.00%) and the maximum (21.4%) indicates that there is a Council, which did not use the institute of the remaining payables, demonstrating the importance of evaluating in future research whether it is due to good budget planning or not.

The independent variable of interest - collection performance (I_{DA}) was measured by the quotient between the expected and collected revenues, as described in the chapter on methodological procedures. Based on Table 1, the average performance of the collection presented by the Councils is 1.09, which indicates that approximately 109% of the council-year observations were from councils that obtained the expected revenue level higher than the revenue collected, in addition to the standard deviation of 0.143 and minimum and maximum values ranging between 73.9% and 188%. The breadth of the data and the standard deviation indicate a considerable distinction in the way CRMs execute their budget, with regard to the amount of collection performance, which may indicate a non-regular and complex distribution of collection, corroborating the literature (Vasconcelos, 2018; Araújo et al, 2022; and Silva, 2023).

In the average of the variable, ELE points out that approximately 12.5% of the observations had the indicator of remains payable influenced by the election year and 25% by the pre-election year. The means and medians of the remainder-to-pay proxies are not consistent with the results of previous research (Silva, 2023; Queiroz, 2018). A difference of 12.5%, that is, in a descriptive approach in this sample there are indications that the pre-election year influences the number of Councils that increase the number of expenses registered in remains to be paid.

Finally, the POP variable used as a proxy for the size of the Regional Medical Councils – registered professionals and companies (SOPs) – was the result of the natural logarithm of this population, in order to avoid possible econometric problems regarding the homogeneity of the data. This variable had a mean of 9.27, with a standard deviation of 1.33, a minimum value of 2,370 and a maximum of 12,400. This high variation points to a diversification in the size of the councils studied, which may present different behaviors, as well as different challenges regarding budget execution. This descriptive statistic corroborates the study by Vasconcelos (2018) and Silva (2023).

Table 2 shows the correlation coefficients estimated for the chosen explanatory variables. It is observed that they indicate that there is no significant correlation between them.

Table 2: Correlation matrix of dependent variables

	I_RP	I_DA	I_POP	P_ELE	HE
I_RP	1,0000				
I_DA	-0,0693	1,0000			
I_POP	0,1112	-0,2590	1,0000		
P_ELE	0,0623	-0,0656	0,0610	1,0000	
HE	-0,0256	0,0098	-0,0064	-0,2182	1,0000

Source: Survey Data

Note: Using all observations 1:1 - 27:8. 5% critical value (two-tailed) = 0.1335 to n = 216

ANALYSIS OF THE STATISTICAL MODEL

To answer the hypothesis of this research, the statistical model sought to analyze whether the performance of budget revenue collection positively influences the registration of expenses in remains payable in the Regional Councils of Medicine, for which the GRETl software was used as support.

The results of the model presented in topic 3 of this research are shown in Table 3 below. The data obtained were worked with panel data with random effects, presenting itself as the best estimated model.

From the analysis of the assumptions, the model presented serial autocorrelation problems, since in the Wooldridge/Durbin Watson test ($DW \sim 2$) the value found (1.02) is outside the acceptable limit, as a correction measure we sought to perform the lag of the main variable (I_DA), to achieve the necessary adjustment of the model, but without success. In view of the above, we chose to maintain the model initially proposed and continue the analyses.

In addition, the data did not present multicollinearity problems, according to the VIF ($IND_DA - 1.075 < I_POP - 1.074 < P_ELE - 1.057 < ELE - 1.050 < 10$). The White test (0.974983) did not indicate heteroscedasticity problems in the residuals, since the natural logarithm was used to measure the population, as well as dummies variables were used in the control variables. In addition, there were also no problems of correct specification, through the Reset Test (0.59), as well as non-linearity (0.29).

After analyzing the assumptions of the estimation of the parameters by OOM, linear regression was performed, which presented the following results:

Table 3 – Regression Results

	Coefficient	Standard Error	t-reason	p-value
const	0,00922629	0,0309432	0,2982	0,7659
IND_DA	-0,0106767	0,0186174	-0,5735	0,5669
HE	0,00439764	0,00607522	0,7239	0,4700
P_ELE	-0,00153401	0,00792936	-0,1935	0,8468
I_POP	0,00276546	0,00200561	1,379	0,1694
Average var. dependent	0,024191		D.P. was. Dependente	0,037584
Sum resid. Square	0,298480		Regression P.E.	0,037611
R-squared	0,017173		R-squared set	-0,001459
F(4, 211)	0,921720		P-value(F)	0,452168
Likelihood log	404,6168		Akaike Criterion	-799,2337
Schwarz's criterion	-782,3573		Cr�terio Hannan-Quinn	-792,4156
Checker	0,465336		Durbin-Watson	1,024151

Source: Survey Data

The independent variable of interest corresponds to the performance of the collection. It can be seen that this variable I_DA did not present statistical significance at a level of 5%, that is, the performance of the collection does not influence the remaining payables. Based on this evidence, the research hypothesis can be refuted. This evidence contradicts previous research (Aquino & Azevedo,



2017; Araújo et al., 2022; Costa et al., 2021; Silva, 2023) that identified a relationship of influence of the collection on the remains to be paid.

In this study, we have two control variables that correspond to dummy, which indicate election year and pre-election year. It is noted that the ELE and P_ELE variables did not present statistical significance at a level of 5%, that is, the election and pre-election years do not have a significant influence on the I_RP. This finding confirms the descriptive statistic to the extent that average rates of 12.5% and 25%, respectively, of impacts on the remains to be paid were identified. Therefore, election and pre-election years do not exert a significant influence on the index of expenses entered in remains to be paid. It is noteworthy that the absence of statistical significance of the ELE and P_ELE variable means that the variation in the remaining payables in election and pre-election years does not differ statistically from the average variation in non-election years. In this sense, the lack of statistical significance of the ELE and P_ELE variable obtained by the present study contradicts previous studies (Queiroz, 2018; Coelho, Santana, Fey & dos Santos, 2019; Silva, 2023) that identified changes in expenses entered in remains payable in election or pre-election years.

Finally, in this study, the POP variable, taken as a proxy for the size of the Councils, also did not present statistical significance and positive sign. This would mean that the larger the population of the Councils, the greater the registration in unpaid remainders. This evidence contradicts the results presented by Coelho, dos Anjos, Miranda, and de Freitas (2018) and Araújo (2022).

DEVELOPMENT

PUBLIC CHOICE THEORY

Public Choice Theory provides the theoretical support for the relationships analyzed in this article. This theory began its first steps in the 50s and 60s aiming to counter-argue the prevailing welfare economy at the time. Public choice originates in the search to identify government failures (public sector), through the relationships between economy, self-interest of the public manager, inefficiency of public administration, political parties, etc. (Pereira, 1997)

From the 50's, after World War II, the theory of public choice emerged with the purpose of investigating the relations between the economy (market) and political relations, especially decision-making in non-market or political market situations. Dias (2009) highlights in his study the contributions of James Buchanan, one of the precursors of public choice theory, along with scholars such as Duncan Backer, Kenneth Arrow, Anthony Downs, William Riker, Gordon Tullock and Mancur Olson.

Sallaberry et al. (2020) contextualize the theory of public choice to the contemporary Brazilian reality, given the scenario of successive news, sometimes scandals, involving public officials, mostly politicians, whether for misappropriation of public resources, acts of corruption, for low return of taxes for



the benefit of society, demonstrating the direct relationship between the self-interest of the public manager, decision-making and the impact on the application of public resources.

This theory seeks to understand the management of the public sector from the analysis of power and its decisions chosen according to the well-being of the people (Pereira, 1997). Dias (2009) argues that since the public budget is a complex political process in which the participants have often conflicting interests, it is observed that, in an environment of great uncertainty, the actors have the incentive to develop strategies with the objective of increasing their respective room for maneuver. From this dynamic process emerge patterns of behavior identified as atypical, but very well thought out.

PUBLIC BUDGET AND COLLECTION PERFORMANCE

The implementation of public policies and what has been established as the State's obligations to provide for the social needs contained in the Magna Carta necessarily permeate the planning instruments, namely, the Multi-Year Plan Law (PPA), the Budget Guidelines Law (LDO) and the Annual Budget Law (LOA) (BRASIL, 1988).

The public budget is the instrument that points out the forecast of revenues and the fixing of expenses. The Manual of Accounting Applied to the Public Sector - MCASP (2022) defines public revenue as the inflow of financial resources into the State coffers and collection of all budget revenue that may represent budgetary financial inflows, including those from credit operations.

The revenue must be estimated considering the revenue collected in the last three years prior to the one in which the proposal was prepared, according to paragraph a of article 22 of Law 4,320/1964. Revenue estimation is, by nature, essentially technical, however the budgeting process suffers from the influence of external factors such as the economic scenario, legislation, and other factors (Costa, Vasconcelos, Souto & de Sousa, 2021).

In line with these factors, the public manager, formulator of public policies, aiming at his own interests, uses budgetary discretion to manipulate revenues, promoting overestimation of revenues, especially during election periods, in order to convince voters that the economy is in good condition. (Farjado, 2016; Costa et. al., 2021; Silva, 2023).

The international literature points out that changes in the estimate of revenue, whether overestimating or underestimating, especially during election periods, can cause changes in public expenditures, since by increasing revenue, it is possible to afford more spending programs at the same time, demonstrating a supposed positive fiscal competence on the part of the public manager. (Jochimsen & Lehmann, 2017; Boukaria & Veiga, 2018; Baerlocher & Schneider, 2021).

For the purposes of this research, to capture the evidence of budgetary manipulation of revenue, a proxy will be used to be operationalized by the collection performance indicator, constituted by the



quotient between the expected revenue and the revenue collected, since it is expected, according to theoretical foundation, that its overestimation will occur, in strategic periods for the manager, aligned with the expansion of enrollment in remains to be paid (Silva, 2023).

PUBLIC BUDGET AND REMAINS TO BE PAID

The institute of Remains to Pay was established through Federal Law 4.320 of March 17, 1964, a provision that established the General Rules of Financial Law for the preparation and control of the budgets and balance sheets of the Union, the States, the Municipalities and the Federal District, being considered remains to be paid the expenses committed, but not paid until December 31, distinguishing the processed from the unprocessed.

The remaining payables are legitimately committed expenses, whose object of commitment has already been received, that is, the one whose second stage of the expense, settlement, has already occurred, characterized as an obligation of the power to execute payments to suppliers. Unprocessed payables, on the other hand, are legally committed expenses that were not settled or paid by the end of the fiscal year, that is, there was no receipt of goods and services in the year of issuance of the commitment.

As Aquino and Azevedo (2017) state, the use of the remaining payables, a type of mechanism for carrying credits and deficits between periods (carry-over or carry-over deficit), when carrying amounts between budget years, can cause negative effects on financial execution in the following year, making it difficult to manage such balance and obtain a clear notion of the fiscal result in the government.

The remaining payables have become the subject of much research because they represent a potential instrument for the manipulation of public resources, such as the loss of budgetary credibility Aquino and Azevedo (2017) and the loss of budget annuality (Carvalho, 2012).

The proxy used to measure the level of registration of expenses in the remaining payables of the regional medical councils was the indicator calculated by the quotient between the remaining payables registered in the year and the committed budget expenditure (Silva, 2023).

PREVIOUS STUDIES

Studies carried out in Spain have suggested the manipulation of revenue by public managers as a "maneuver" to serve their own interests and maintain power, in addition to demonstrating to society, the real interested and affected by the good use of public resources, what only interests them. Benito, Guillamon and Bastida (2015) found as a result of their research the overestimation of budget revenue, especially during election periods, manipulating budget forecasts, giving greater freedom to achieve popularity.



In line with this, Boukaria and Veiga (2018) studied the political and institutional determinants of budget forecast errors in Portuguese and French municipalities and found similar results - that there is in the manipulation of revenues according to the political-electoral bias, concluding that revenue forecasts are carried out to meet the interests of public managers in an opportunistic manner.

In view of the above, the following proposition is considered, namely: public managers aim at their own interests to maintain status and power, using, for this, budgetary manipulations of revenue, to obtain greater freedom and flexibility, denoting for society its potential to execute beneficial equipment for the collectivity, especially during election periods.

From quantitative methods, with the application of a multiple regression model through OOM, it is intended to analyze the behavior of the variables to answer the following research hypothesis: H1 - there is a positive relationship between the performance of budget revenue collection and the registration of expenses in remains to be paid.

FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

The objective of the research was to verify the influence of the performance of the collection, a proxy used to capture the manipulation of budget revenue, on the indicator of remains payable of the regional medical councils. The sample was composed of the 27 regional councils in the period from 2015 to 201222, comprising three electoral cycles.

Considering that unpaid remainders, although a legal institute, has become an artifice of political maneuvers, making it one of the major problems of Brazilian budgetary-financial execution, this mechanism has come to be considered a type of carry-over, detrimental to the management of budget balance, the loss of credibility and budget annuality and to obtain a clear notion of the government's fiscal result (Aquino & Azevedo, 2017; Jochimsen & Lehmann, 2017).

From a statistical point of view, this article chose the best multiple linear regression model for the data of this research, with panel data with random effects, robust for heteroscedasticity and serial autocorrelation problems.

However, the evidence revealed that the variable of interest that indicates collection performance (I_{DA}) did not present statistical significance, as well as the control variables, the election year, the pre-election year and the population (proxy used to capture the size of the Council), that is, they do not exert a significant influence on the indicator of remains to be paid, therefore, no evidence was found to support the research hypothesis.

Finally, the index created by this research consists of a managerial indicator, with the purpose of evaluating the budgetary manipulation of revenues and it is not possible to conclude that the evidence obtained by the research is valid for other types of indicators or samples. In this sense, it is suggested, for



future research, the use of other metrics, and the analysis with a larger sample of observations, so that knowledge can be expanded on how the overestimation of revenues shapes the inscription of expenses in remains to be paid.



REFERENCES

- Andrade, R. R. (2022). *Restos a pagar na administração pública federal: uma análise do instrumento no Conselho Administrativo de Defesa Econômica*. (2019). Dissertation on the period from 2015 to 2019. Instituto Brasileiro de Ensino, Desenvolvimento e Pesquisa (IDP), Brasília, Brazil. Retrieved from <https://repositorio.idp.edu.br/handle/123456789/4274>
- Aquino, A. C. B., & Azevedo, R. R. (2017). Restos a pagar and the loss of budgetary credibility. *Revista de Administração Pública*, 51(4), 580–595. Retrieved from <https://periodicos.fgv.br/rap/article/view/71173>
- Araújo, J. G. R. de, Lins, T. S. M., & Diniz, J. A. (2022). The “use it or lose it” phenomenon in the budget execution of federal universities and the recording of leftover payments. *Advances in Scientific and Applied Accounting*, 109–124.
- Araújo, R. J. R. D. (2022). Electoral incentives and budgetary results management through leftover payments: A study of Brazilian municipalities (Doctoral thesis). Federal University of Paraíba (UFPB), João Pessoa, PB, Brazil.
- Baerlocher, D., & Schneider, R. (2021). Cold bacon: Co-partisan politics in Brazil. *Public Choice*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11127-020-00869-4>
- Benito, B., Guillamón, M. D., & Bastida, F. (2015). Budget forecast deviations in municipal governments: Determinants and implications. *Australian Accounting Review*, 25(1), 45–70.
- Boukari, M., & Veiga, F. J. (2018). Disentangling political and institutional determinants of budget forecast errors: A comparative approach. *Journal of Comparative Economics*, 46(4), 1030–1045.
- Brazil. (1988). Constitution of the Federative Republic of Brazil of 1988. [Planalto.gov.br](http://planalto.gov.br), October 5, 1988. Retrieved from www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/Constituicao/Constituicao.htm
- Carvalho, M. B. (2012). Leftover payments and budgetary annuality (Monograph/Term Paper). Instituto Serzedello Corrêa (ISC), Brasília, Brazil. Retrieved from <https://repositorio.enap.gov.br/handle/1/4699>
- Coelho, G. N., Santana, G. M., Fey, V. A., & dos Santos, E. A. (2019). Management of leftover payments: A case study of results achieved by UFSC from 2011 to 2016. *Revista Catarinense da Ciência Contábil*, 18, 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.16930/2237-766220192738>
- Costa, M. I. da, de Vasconcelos, Neta, A. F., Souto, A. M. L., & de Sousa, J. E. B. S. (2021). Reflection of budget estimation errors on the recording of leftover payments in Brazilian states. Retrieved from <https://convibra.org/publicacao/26918/>
- Decker, L., Rosa, F. S. da, & Costa, G. D. (2018, August 12-14). Evolution of leftover payments recording in the state of Santa Catarina from 2011 to 2017.
- Dias, M. A. (2009). James Buchanan and “politics” in public choice. *Ponto-e-Vírgula: Revista de Ciências Sociais*, 6.



- Fajardo, B. A. G. (2016). Budgetary biases in subnational entities: An analysis from the perspective of state revenue estimation (Doctoral thesis). Escola Brasileira de Administração Pública e de Empresas da Fundação Getúlio Vargas.
- Feitosa, D. G., & Freitas, M. A. L. de. (2021). The impact of unprocessed leftover payments on the classification of Brazilian public universities. *Revista de Administração Educacional*, 12(2), 197. <https://doi.org/10.51359/2359-1382.2021.247010>
- Gujarati, D. N., & Porter, D. C. (2011). *Basic econometrics* (5th ed.). Porto Alegre, RS: Amgh.
- Jochimsen, B., & Lehmann, R. (2017). On the political economy of national tax revenue forecasts: Evidence from OECD countries. *Public Choice*, 170(3), 211–230.
- Lei n. 4.320, de 17 de março de 1964. (1964). Establishes General Norms of Financial Law for the preparation and control of the budgets and balances of the Union, States, Municipalities, and the Federal District. Retrieved from http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/Leis/L4320.htm
- Pereira, P. T. (1997). The theory of public choice: A neoliberal approach? *Análise Social*, 32(141), 419–442. Retrieved from [jstor.org](http://www.jstor.org)
- Queiroz, D. B. (2018). Influence of election years, changes in public management, and electoral mandates on changes in the composition of public spending in Brazilian states. *REUNIR Revista de Administração Contabilidade e Sustentabilidade*, 8(3), 68–77.
- Sallaberry, J. D., et al. (2020). Research in public choice theory: Profile, sources, and production. *Revista de Contabilidade do Mestrado em Ciências Contábeis da UERJ*, 24(1), 56–73. Retrieved from www.atena.org.br/revista/ojs-2.2.3-08/index.php/UERJ/article/viewArticle/3364
- Silva, V. F. da. (2023). Performance of revenue collection and recording of leftover payments: A study in Brazilian municipalities. Retrieved from <https://repositorio.ufpb.br/jspui/handle/123456789/27063>
- Souza, C. A. de, & Rodrigues, W. M. (2018). Analysis of leftover payments and municipal budgets: A perspective on leftover payments, availability, and indebtedness. *Revista Eletrônica de Ciências Contábeis*, 7(1), 1–30.
- STN. (2022). *Manual of Applied Accounting to the Public Sector (MCASP)*, 9th edition. Retrieved from https://www.tesouro.fazenda.gov.br/documents/10180/695350/CPU_MCA%20ed+-+publica%C3%A7%C3%A3o_com+capa_2vs/4b3db821-e4f9-43f8-8064-04f5d778c9f6
- Vasconcelos, C. C. C. (2018). The financial impacts of leftover payments on budgetary and financial execution in IFES in the Central-West region from 2008 to 2016 (Master's thesis in Public Administration). Federal University of Goiás, Aparecida de Goiânia.